Taking Stock of Momentum at CUNY

SARAH TRUELSCH AND MARI WATANABE-ROSE
AUGUST 2017
We will discuss current measures of academic momentum at CUNY in the context of our graduation goals.

- CUNY’s graduation goals in context
  - Trends in completion by race and Pell status
  - Time to degree
- Credit taking patterns
  - First-year milestones
  - Impact of greater credit-taking on academic outcomes
- Gateway course completion
- Remedial Trends
- Current efforts underway at CUNY to support a momentum year strategy
CUNY’s 6-year graduation rates for bachelor’s programs have been rising and will need to continue growing at a steady pace to meet our goals.

Goal: We will raise by 10 points the 6-year graduation rate for bachelor's programs

TRENDS IN THE 6-YEAR BACCALAUREATE GRADUATION RATE OF FULL-TIME FRESHMEN AND PROGRESS NEEDED TO TARGET

Entering cohort year

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Graduation Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>51.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>54.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>64.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Target: 64.8
Baccalaureate graduation rates have improved for students of all races/ethnicities, but significant gaps remain between groups.

*TRENDS IN 6-YEAR BACCALAUREATE SYSTEM GRADUATION RATES BY RACE/ETHNICITY*
Graduation rate gaps by family income (Pell status) are not as stark as those by race, but poorer students are less likely to graduate within 4 years than wealthier students.
CUNY’s community college graduation rates are at an all-time high after recent increases, but will need to improve at a faster pace to meet our goals.

**Goal: CUNY will double 3-year graduation rates for associate degrees**

TRENDS IN THE 3-YEAR ASSOCIATE GRADUATION RATES OF FULL-TIME FRESHMEN AND PROGRESS NEEDED TOWARD GOALS*

*Includes freshmen in associate programs at community and comprehensive colleges. Graduation rates are higher at community colleges alone because many students at comprehensive colleges move into baccalaureate programs without first getting associate degrees.
Associate graduation rates have improved for students of all races/ethnicities. The gaps between race groups are smaller than at the baccalaureate level, but...
There is an important gap between enrolling in associate versus bachelor’s programs in the first place. Black and Hispanic students are more likely to start in associate programs than bachelor’s programs. The opposite is true for white and Asian students.

FRESHMAN ENROLLMENT BY RACE AND DEGREE: AY 2015-16
Most CUNY graduates take longer than the expected time to graduate.

BACHELOR’S GRADUATION RATES: FIRST-TIME, FULL-TIME FRESHMEN

- 8 years, 6.4%
- 6 years, 8.9%
- 5 years, 23.1%
- 4 years, 20.8%
- 10 years, 2.3%

ASSOCIATE GRADUATION RATES: FIRST-TIME, FULL-TIME FRESHMEN

- 4 years, 6.6%
- 3 years, 12.6%
- 2 years, 4.9%
- 10 years, 2.3%
Not many students currently take 15 credits in a term, and many fewer take 15 credits every term until graduation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fall 2016 (or most recent available)</th>
<th>Bachelor’s (n=120,639)</th>
<th>Associate (n=100,824)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Average number of credits taken</td>
<td>12.1</td>
<td>11.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average number of credits passed</td>
<td>10.4</td>
<td>8.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage who take 15 credits+ hours</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage who pass 15 credits+ hours (Fall 2015)</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage who accumulate 15+ credits every consecutive term until on-time graduation (Fall 2010 cohort)</td>
<td>&lt;1%</td>
<td>&lt;1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Currently, students who earn bachelor’s degrees within 4 years do so by bringing in credits and taking courses in summer and winter.

• Of the fall 2010 cohort who graduated within 4 years
  • More than 50% brought in pre-college credit (e.g., AP, College Now), and most of those 4+ credits
  • About half earned credit in some summer or winter term (more often summer)
  • Less than 100 accrued 15 credits in consecutive fall and spring terms
  • Many accrued more than 120 credits. The average credits at graduation was 123.

• Ensuring that students take 15 credits per semester does not ensure that they take only 8 semesters to graduate, unless they take the right 15 credits.

• The average graduate (not limited to on-time graduates) has accumulated 128+ credits.
It is not clear why bachelor’s students take fewer than 15 credits -- because they do not have to, do not want to, or are unable to register for relevant classes.

- In bachelor’s programs, average credits decrease with class standing:
  - First-time freshmen: 14.4 credits
  - Sophomores: 12.9
  - Seniors: 12.1

- On the 2016 Student Experience Survey, 34% of senior college students reported not being able to register for a class they wanted in the previous semester, with more upperclassmen saying so than lowerclassmen, and nearly half saying they could not register for a class required for their major.
Both CUNY internal research and national studies have found that students do no worse academically—and often better—when they take 15 vs. 12 credits.

Results of regression analyses comparing CUNY freshmen who take 15 vs. 12 credits, controlling for demographics and high school academic achievement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baccalaureate</th>
<th>Associate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Students who take 15 credits vs. 12 in their first semester...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credits Earned Term 1</td>
<td>Earn about 2.2 more credits (13.1 vs. 11.0)</td>
<td>Earn about 0.8 more credits (7.3 vs. 6.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cum. Credits Earned Term 2</td>
<td>Earn about 2.9 more credits (25.2 vs. 22.3)</td>
<td>Earn about 1.5 more credits (15.6 vs. 14.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Re-Enroll Term 2</td>
<td>Have a slightly higher probability of re-enrolling (96.5% vs. 95.1%)</td>
<td>Have a 3.9 percentage points higher probability of re-enrolling (88.8% vs. 84.8%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GPA Term 1</td>
<td>Earn about the same GPAs (2.76 vs. 2.77)</td>
<td>Earn slightly higher GPAs (2.24 vs. 2.14)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduation</td>
<td>Have a higher probability of graduating in any time frame: 4 years: 21.8% vs. 16.4% 5 years: 50.0% vs. 43.7%; 6 years: 59.0% vs. 54.1%</td>
<td>Have a higher probability of graduating or transferring in any time frame: 2 years: 2.2% vs. 0.9% 3 years: 13.3% vs. 9.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Most students are already off track for on-time graduation after their first year.

PERCENTAGE OF FULL-TIME FRESHMEN COMPLETING 24 AND 30 CREDITS BY END OF FIRST YEAR: FALL 2015

*Results are after fall and spring semester. A small number of additional students reach these milestones at the end of the summer term.*
Associate students start at a disadvantage in credit accumulation because so many are assigned to remediation. On top of that, they attempt fewer credits than bachelor’s students.

Among associate students

- About 80% are assigned to some remediation, requiring more than 60 credit hours to graduate.
- The average student registers for fewer courses than the average bachelor’s student, even counting remedial credits.
- Less than 5% graduate in 2 years.
- Of students who have earned a degree or transferred to a bachelor’s programs within 3 years of entry, ~20% have stopped out for at least 1 fall or spring semester during that time.
Only a third of associate students have completed a credit-bearing math course by the end of their first year, and only 2/3 have complete Freshman Composition.

PERCENTAGE OF ASSOCIATE FRESHMEN WHO COMPLETED GATEWAY COURSES* WITHIN ONE YEAR OF ENTRY, BY SUBJECT: FALL 2013

*Counts math courses worth 3 or more credits
Students assigned to developmental education are even less likely to complete gateway courses in their first year, although trends have improved somewhat recently.

TRENDS IN THE PERCENTAGE OF ASSOCIATE FRESHMEN WITH DEVELOPMENTAL NEED WHO COMPLETED A GATEWAY COURSE WITHIN ONE YEAR OF ENTRY, BY SUBJECT
New practices will decrease assignment to developmental education, but the majority of associate freshmen will still be assigned to some intervention.
Current Efforts at CUNY

What efforts have been made at CUNY so far?

- Degree Mapping
- Remediation Reforms
- 15 to Finish
Current Efforts at CUNY: Degree Mapping

May 2016 survey conducted by subgroup of 2015/16 Academic Momentum Group

- All 18 colleges responded.
- 11 colleges reported having a degree map for at least some of its majors.
- 5 of the 11 colleges, however, did not provide a sample, did not have maps available online, or confused degree maps with list of required courses.
Current Efforts at CUNY: Degree Mapping

2017 Working Group’s recommendations

- Develop and disseminate a CUNY-wide definition of degree maps
- Establish CUNY-wide policies for creating, updating, and maintaining degree maps
- Integrate degree mapping across CUNY as part of a broader academic momentum campaign
Current Efforts at CUNY: Remediation Reforms (Math)

2016 memos from EVC Rabinowitz regarding reforms

- Changes in placement into and exit from remediation.
- Requirement for all associate-granting colleges to offer at least one college-level math course with corequisite support for non-STEM majors assigned to math remediation (who are arithmetic-proficient).
- February 2017 - All colleges submitted their plans.
Current Efforts at CUNY: Remediation Reforms (Math)

Course-offering statuses in Fall 2017 (10 associate-granting colleges)

- 3 colleges offer college-level Statistics with coreq support (31, 18, 1 sections)
- 4 colleges offer college-level QR with coreq support (2, 1, 1, 1 sections)
- 3 colleges offer College Algebra with coreq support (16, 4, 2 sections)
- Currently, 1 college offers coreq remediation in all three pathways (Stats, QR, College Algebra)
Current Efforts at CUNY: Remediation Reforms (Math)

Plans

- 4 colleges do not offer any corequisite remediation in Fall 2017
- The 4 colleges plan to offer college-level QR with coreq support in Spring 2018
- 1 of the 4 plans to also offer College Algebra with coreq support in Spring 2018
- 0 of the 4 included plans to offer Statistics with coreq support in the future.
Statutes in Fall 2017

- All 7 community colleges offer college-level reading and/or writing courses for those who scored below cutoff on placement exams.

- One comprehensive college does not offer, but is currently planning to offer a college-level course with support.

- Plans of the other two comprehensive colleges are pending updates.
Current Efforts at CUNY: 15 to Finish

June 2017 recommendations/updates from subgroup of 2015/16 Academic Momentum Group

- Expand the use of the 15-credit registration pop-up: All colleges have now adopted the pop-up.

Sample pop-up:
Current Efforts at CUNY: 15 to Finish

June 2017 recommendations/updates from subgroup of 2015/16 Academic Momentum Group (continued)

- Encourage colleges to create plans and/or campaigns for 15 credits per semester or 30 credits per year: Underway

- Campaigns at a few colleges seem effective (see next slide: source="Key CUNY Enrollment trends and Fiscal Implications" presentation in June 2016)
Costs and benefits of encouraging students to take 15 credits per semester

We have made progress in increasing the percentage of students who take 15 credits or more. Credit accumulation initiatives at Hunter, John Jay, and CSI appear to have been quite effective.
Current Efforts at CUNY: Conclusion

- CUNY colleges have tried different strategies to increase college completion.
- There are individual differences among colleges in terms of implementations of the strategies.
- Some colleges may need models/guidance for implementations in one or more of the three areas.
- Narrowing the implementation gap among colleges may be most challenging in math remediation reforms.